Real Options Analysis
The challenge and the opportunity

Ian Robinson
Tim Kyng

IAAust BIENNIAL CONVENTION 2003
## Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is a real option?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The benefits of ROA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brief history of ROA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The acid test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current ROA usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities for actuaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education proposals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions &amp; discussion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
This is an asset-in-place

This is a real option

Invest now and hope for best

Wait for uncertainty to be resolved
What is a real option?

“A real option is the right, but not the obligation, to acquire, expand, contract, abandon or switch some or all of an economic asset on fixed terms on or before the time the opportunity ceases to be available.”
What is a real option? (cont)

• Physical and strategic economic assets and opportunities of firm
  – Not financial options or contractual liabilities

• Management flexibility
  – to time investment decisions
  – to optimise those assets and opportunities

• Usually
  – distant from market
  – not well defined
  – very large sums of money
  – long option life
Example: ACME Mines Inc

- **Phased investment:**
  - Phase 1: survey: $50m - 3 years
  - Phase 2: test drilling: $300m – 4 years
  - Phase 3: build mine: $500m – 2 years
  - At each phase, various chances of success in terms of potential reserves and purity are estimated

- **Optionality**
  - Depending on results, decisions are made at time whether to proceed to next phase
  - Limits downside risk

- **Other parameters:**
  - Gold price: $300 per ounce
  - Extraction cost: $250 per ounce
  - Demand: 1m oz pa
  - $US exchange rate: $0.60
  - Risk-free discount rate: 5%
Example: ACME Mines Inc (cont)

• Traditional DCF works well until we introduce market uncertainty:
  – Gold price: 30% volatility
  – Extraction cost: 15% volatility, 10% drift
  – Demand: 20% volatility, 10% drift
  – $US exchange rate: 10% volatility, mean reverting

• DTA goes a lot of the way but is flawed
  – Market inconsistent discount rate

• We require:
  – Real options approach (risk neutrality)
  – Sophisticated modeling tools and techniques
The flaw in the traditional investment decision rule

Invest now if \( NPV > 0 \)

• Traditional capital budgeting attempts to optimise decision when:
  – Available capital resources limited
  – Available investment alternatives exist

• …but ignores ability to delay investment
Every potential investment includes an option to wait

Invest now if $NPV_{NOW} > \max(NPV_{DEFER}, 0)$

Defer investment if $NPV_{DEFER} > \max(NPV_{NOW}, 0)$

• ROA identifies and values such options
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
When traditional valuation models work fine

- Future changes are reasonably predictable
- No significant real options exist
- Little uncertainty about significant real options that do exist
- Mature investments with little or no follow-on opportunities
When traditional valuation models fail

- **High market uncertainty**
  - Market prices
  - Supply or demand

- **Contingent proposition**
  - Postponement
  - Information discovery
  - Management flexibility to make mid-course changes

- **Near-the-money decisions**
  - Where the decision is not obvious

- **Non-linear outcomes**
  - \( \max[E(V)-K,0] \neq E[\max(V-K,0)] \)
  - ‘Actuarial’ approach vs options approach
ROA takes over when others may falter

These techniques enhance but do not replace real options analysis.

Manager flexibility

DCF

DTA

ROA

Market uncertainty

Sensitivity testing

Scenario analysis

Monte Carlo simulation

Test financial impact of individual assumptions. Sets boundaries of uncertainty

Test financial impact of sets of assumptions

Model whole probability distributions of assumptions and financial outcomes
Benefits of ROA

• Focuses on importance of **timing**, not just value

• Recognises management’s **flexibility** to alter its operating strategy and the value of opportunities:
  – **reactively** as events unfold
  – **proactively** by manipulating option value drivers

• Market consistent valuation of non-linear real option payoffs
# Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What is a real option?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The benefits of ROA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brief history of ROA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The acid test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current ROA usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities for actuaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education proposals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions &amp; discussion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Market: seemingly rejects CF based valuation

- Technology and venture stock boom
- Economic value / Market value dichotomy increases
- “Irrational exuberance” - Greenspan

Cost control
Budgets
Payback-period

Cash flow
Value
DCF (NPV, IRR, WACC)
Risk

Shareholder value
EVA®, TSR, etc
“Value chains”
“Value propositions”

Tech bubble bursts
Business: increasingly uncomfortable with DCF

- Excessive discount rates (little relation to MPT)
- Conservative terminal values
- Many projects were rejected due to (or accepted despite of) a perception of undervaluation

1960’s | 1970’s | 1980’s | 1990’s | 2000’s

Cost control
Budgets
Payback-period

Cash flow
Value
DCF (NPV, IRR, WACC)
Risk

Shareholder value
EVA®, TSR, etc
“Value chains”
“Value propositions”
Academics: increased misgivings about DCF

- DCF, while not flawed, was
  - being misunderstood and/or misused
  - missing the manifestations of decision making flexibility
  - DCF was failing to give right signals

1960’s  1970’s  1980’s  1990’s  2000’s

Cost control
Budgets
Payback-period

Cash flow
Value
DCF (NPV, IRR, WACC)
Risk

Shareholder value
EVA®, TSR, etc
“Value chains”
“Value propositions”
Beginning of closure between strategy and finance.

1973
Black-Scholes-Merton
- First closed formula solution for option pricing

1984
Myers
- Recognised that DCF tended to understate option value in growing businesses.
- Coined term ‘real options’

1994
Dixit & Pindyck
Brought academic research together into one reference

Increasing flow of research:
- Flexibility and information have real and sometimes substantial value.
- Option theory can help identify and measure options embedded in real assets.
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
“The acid test of any weird theory is this: Can you make money from it?”

Paul Davies in About Time, p67
Yes! Authors, publishers...

Real Options - New Book Releases

Source: Amazon.com  March 2003

3 mths!
Yes! Conference organisers, travel industry...

**7th Annual International Conference on**

**Real Options**

*Theory Meets Practice*

---

**Workshop**

Option Valuation in Energy and Environmental Issues

11 February 2003
Fraunhofer ISI
Karlsruhe, Germany

---

**How To Apply Real Options in Valuing & Managing Strategic Investments**

29 August 2000

The Sebel of Sydney, 23 Elizabeth Bay Road, Elizabeth Bay NSW 2011
Yes! Trainers, Web developers, advisers...

- Training
  - consultancies
  - software suppliers
- Exclusive Internet sites
  - number
- Consultancies
  - 4

Using Real Options Short Course
May 28-30, 2003
"Using Real Options to Value & Manage Natural Resource Projects"
Yes! …and businesses!

- **Long-time adherents**
  - Pharmaceutical & biotech companies
  - Petroleum, gas & mineral companies
  - Energy firms
  - Chemical industry

- **Recent converts**
  - Automobile
  - Computer industry
  - Airline industry
  - Energy production
  - Telecommunications
  - Information technology
  - E-commerce
  - Environment
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
ROA is being used in a wide variety ways

- R&D decisions
- Phased investments
- Growth and expansionary planning
- Timing decisions
- Optimisation of competing interests
- Valuing assets
- Acquisitions
- Trading tool
1997 survey of UK industrial companies

• Real options play a significant role in investments and their appraisal.
• Firms use rules of thumb that concern options eg staging of investments
• Small number of firms studying ROA
• Behavioural and organisational considerations inhibit exercising options
Why did barriers exist?

\[ C = \text{SN}([\ln(S/X)+(r+\sigma^2/2)t]/\sigma\sqrt{t}) - \]
\[ Xe^{-rt\text{N}([\ln(S/X)+(r-\sigma^2/2)t]/\sigma\sqrt{t})} \]

\[ V = Ge^{-r\tau} d(k,h;\rho) - Ke^{-r\tau} d(k-\sigma\sqrt{\tau^*,k-\sigma\sqrt{\tau};\rho}) - \]
\[ K^*e^{-r\tau} D(k-\sigma\sqrt{\tau^*}) \]

\[ F(V(t)) = \max\{V(t) - 1, e^{-\rho dt}E[F(V(t+dt))]| \]
Early adoption of ROA was hindered but eventually overcome.

Limited applications and misbeliefs...

- SDEs necessary
- Limited computer and software power
- OT cannot be applied to non-traded assets
- Simple options
- Single source of market uncertainty

...became many applications.

- Binomial trees & simulation
- Low cost, fast, powerful PCs and software
- OT can be applied to assets distant from market
- Options on options
- Multiple sources of uncertainty

Source: Copeland & Antikarov (2001)
ROA offers the possibility of melding strategic thinking, management flexibility and analytic rigour, all using the well accepted and tested framework of traditional DCF and options theory.

\[
\frac{CF_1}{1 + r} + \frac{CF_2}{(1 + r)^2} + \ldots
\]
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
Go forth actuaries

- Strategic & M&A
- Project evaluation, i.e. phased investments
  - Testing new markets, channels, products etc
- Other?

- Non-traditional areas
  - Resources
    - Coal vs gas power generation
    - Water desalination plants vs dams
  - Infrastructure
    - Transport and road systems
    - Defence acquisitions
  - Environment
    - Urban planning
    - Forestry use
Life was not meant to be easy

• Do not underestimate the selling job
• Do not overplay the numbers
• ROA does not guarantee a good outcome
• Do not lightly dismiss informal methods
• Recognise when options are ‘shared’
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries

Education proposals

Conclusions & discussion
Our profession is at increasing disadvantage compared to others

- Finance courses generally are being expanded to include real options
- Corporate finance texts include more real options content in each edition
- Current IAAust Finance syllabus does not cover real options in any depth (if at all)
- Despite general trend, current suggestion is to eliminate real options entirely from IAAust syllabus
Implications for education

- Investment/Finance specialist level courses undergoing extensive syllabus revision
- Real options would fit very naturally
  - most of necessary technical background already covered (stochastic calculus, option pricing theory, binomial methods, Monte Carlo simulation etc)
  - Scope to remove some of more technical material
- Recommendation:
  - Include/expand real options as a topic within the new Investment/Finance syllabus
  - Module 3 under ‘options’ and/or Module 2 under ‘capital budgeting’
Overview

What is a real option?
The benefits of ROA
Brief history of ROA
The acid test
Current ROA usage
Opportunities for actuaries
Education proposals
Conclusions & discussion
“Today, the real option approach can be regarded as a standard capital budgeting technique. After having been studied by academics for more than two decades, the idea of valuing real investment opportunities analogously to options in financial markets is now treated in many text books and appears ready for practical implementation.”
“The revolution in [valuation] theory has yet to become a full revolution in practice.”

Dr F. Peter Boer in 
Financial Management of R&D 2002
Our discussion options

• **Exercise now**
  – “I can answer that!”

• **Growth option**
  – “I’m glad you asked me that because it allows me to raise another point.”

• **Learning option**
  – “Can you elaborate?”

• **Deferral option**
  – “That’s a good question. We look forward to answering it someday.”

• **Switching option**
  – “Would someone else like to answer that?”

• **Option to abandon**
  – “No comment.”
Questions for discussion

• As a profession, do we want to be part of the ‘revolution in practice’?
• Is ROA another technique the profession should add to its ‘toolkit’ to help gain entry into (for us) new fields?
• Are there real opportunities for application of ROA techniques to actuarial work?
• What difference can actuaries make?
• What does our education system need to do?